Electronic Challenges of Retrofitting 2D Electrically Conductive MOFs to Form 3D Conductive Lattices

Khoa N. Le, Jenna L. Mancuso, and Christopher H. Hendon*

ABSTRACT: Porous electrical conductors offer opportunities for next-generation energy storage solutions and electrocatalytic technologies. Metal–organic frameworks are one of the highest porosity scaffolds but typically feature low electrical conductivity due to their highly ionic metal–ligand interface. In this paper, we use computational approaches to study the inclusion of ligating pillars in a known electrically conductive framework, Ni_3(hexaiminobenzene)_2. We hypothesize that because Ni_3(hexaiminobenzene)_2 is an in-plane conductor, retrofitting this material may yield a 3D-connected network with metallicity in all crystallographic directions. However, we find that while this strategy likely yields unstable connectivity for the Ni²⁺ system, the use of either Cr³⁺ or Fe²⁺ provides a unique avenue to form 3D-connected conductors. The study further highlights the critical role of the metal d⁰ orbitals in creating conductive metal–organic frameworks.

KEYWORDS: conductivity, metal–organic frameworks, density functional theory, retrofitting

INTRODUCTION

Metal–organic frameworks (MOFs) are typically celebrated for their ultrahigh surface area¹ and porous geometries,² which enable their use as separation³ and adsorption media⁴,⁵ and site isolated catalysts.⁶ Yet, their generally poor electrical conductivity prevents their use in most electronic applications.⁷ Efforts to increase the conductivity of MOFs have involved synthesizing novel materials with reduced or zero bandgaps through ligand selection,⁸ doping by mixed valency,⁹ and defect engineering.¹⁰,¹¹ Although a handful of electrically conductive MOFs have been reported,¹² their conductivities are often below 10⁻² S/cm, limiting their utility.¹³ Increasing MOF conductivity would enable the formation of innovative energy storage and sensing technologies.

In general, electrical conductivity depends on three properties: (i) the number of charge carriers, (ii) their charge, and (iii) their mobility. In insulating, undoped MOFs (i.e., those with discrete bandgaps), the charge carrier mobility is often limited by flat bands arising from the highly ionic metal–ligand interface.¹⁴ In those cases, the charge of the carriers is ±1 for a hole or electron. Subsequently, several recent studies characterize and quantify the number and identity of the charge carriers, and most examples show increasing conductivity with chemical oxidation, that is, the formation of holes.¹⁶ Yet, the mobility and directionality of conduction are still limited by the scaffold geometry.¹⁸

The highest performing MOF conductors do not feature an explicit bandgap: in other words, the MOFs are metallic. These scaffolds (e.g., Ni₃(HITP)₂,¹₉ Ni₃(HIB)₂,²⁰ etc.) feature more covalent metal–ligand bonds. Similar to graphitic materials,²² the π-orbitals from the linkers create delocalized bands that exhibit dispersion both in and out of the covalently connected plane.

Yet, the electronic structure of 2D metal–organic graphene analogues is nuanced. There is increasing evidence to suggest that the linkers are oxidized during the formation of these MOFs, rendering them no longer aromatic.²³–²⁸ Considering the most well-studied 2D conductive MOF, Ni₃(HITP)₂ (HITP ≡ 2,3,6,7,10,11-hexaiminotriphenylene),²⁹–³⁵ each HITP linker must be assigned a formal oxidation state of 3− to satisfy the charge neutrality condition. Therefore, each linker would host an odd number of electrons (assuming a single deprotonation has occurred for each amine). However, previous work has elucidated that a monolayer of this material features a discrete bandgap and no unpaired electrons.³⁶ Each pair of linkers can therefore be thought of as a closed-shell −4/−2 pair (a resonance structure of a Robin–Day Class III system).³⁷

While the monolayer features a narrow but discrete bandgap, metallicity is observed in the bulk vdW form (where weak dispersion interactions between stacked linkers arise from π-
orbital overlap). This manifests as the emergence of metallic bands in the bulk electronic band structure along the out-of-plane ($\pi$-stacked) $\Gamma$–Z vector (Figure S1). Broadly, linker-based radicals are thought to be stabilized by two mechanisms: (i) formation of a curved (disperse) band in-plane, delocalizing the electrons within the covalent sheet, and (ii) formation of a curved band out-of-plane, delocalizing the electrons in the vdW direction.

Another consideration for these 2D analogues is the range of accessible sheet stacking arrangements. The potential energy surface of sheet slipping in Ni$_3$(HITP)$_2$ is shallow; with a penalty of <0.7 eV for all parallel-displaced configurations$^{29}$ the pores could be thermally distorted by sheets slipping up to $\sim$0.1 nm in the a/b plane under ambient conditions. The pores could be further occluded by sheets slipping past one another, perhaps under extreme conditions (e.g., high heat and pressure). While the implications for electrical conductivity appear to be minimal based on these partially sheet-slipped band structures,$^{38}$ diminished porosity undermines MOF utility for energy storage applications.

One emergent strategy to maintain the porosity of conductive 2D MOFs is to strengthen the intersheet interactions via retrofitting (a form of postsynthetic ligand modification$^{9,40}$ known to affect both the electronic and structural properties of materials$^{11–41}$). The general concept is that the sheets can be held in place by installing a linker to connect the formally square planar Ni$^{2+}$, yielding octahedral Ni$^{2+}$ and a 3D-connected scaffold. In a recent study, Foster and colleagues demonstrated that the installation of such pillars in Ni$_3$(HITP)$_2$ created a wide bandgap material,$^{38}$ highlighting the importance of d$_z^2$ orbitals on the metals in facilitating Class III delocalization of the ligand. In other words, the pillars destroyed the out-of-plane covalency and resulted in a semiconductor. Thus, the results showed that retrofitting a MOF whose monolayer features a bandgap seems to yield a 3D-connected insulator.

Here, we examine a different family of 2D MOF conductors based on a recently reported structure, Ni$_3$(HIB)$_2$ (HIB $\equiv$ hexaminothiobenzene).$^{20}$ Unlike the triphenylene-based materials, the monolayer is metallic.$^{36}$ The three-electron oxidation of triphenylene can be thought of as yielding a relatively stable quinone monoradical.$^{29}$ We believe metallicity emerges in Ni$_3$(HIB)$_2$ because the same three electron oxidation of a single benzene ring results in a half-populated HIB band, which by definition is metallic. The bulk material is also metallic with metallically dispersed bands in the a/b plane, independent of sheet stacking configuration (see the M–Γ–K vectors in Figure 1). We have previously studied and contrasted Ni$_3$(HITP)$_2$ and Ni$_3$(HIB)$_2$,$^{36}$ revealing dissimilarities in their electronic structure motivated by the in-plane metallicity of the latter.

Metallicity in Ni$_3$(HIB)$_2$ monolayer makes bulk metallicity independent of the stacking orientation and intersheet spacing. In contrast, Ni$_3$(HITP)$_2$ conducts primarily out-of-plane, and increasing intersheet spacing hinders charge transport throughout the material. Resultantly, the previous 2D to 3D retrofitting study turns a 2D conductive MOF into a 3D semiconductor by reducing band dispersion and introducing a bandgap. Instead, we propose modifying Ni$_3$(HIB)$_2$, allowing the formation of 3D MOFs that retain the metallic character of the 2D MOF.

This paper introduces intersheet bridging linkers into Ni$_3$(HIB)$_2$ that induce a change in metallicity and band dispersion of the newly formed 3D-connected material. We show that while this procedure does yield a metal, it is likely due to material instability rather than the desired retrofitted 3D conductor. To overcome this challenge, we propose alternative compositions that may be more thermodynamically accessible. This study further emphasizes the importance of the d$_z^2$ orbital occupancy in forming disperse bands and stable MOF conductors.

### RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

#### Eclipsed versus Staggered Ni$_3$(HIB)$_2$ Models.

While the absolute electronic structure of individual HIB linkers depends on the extent of oxidation, the $\pi$-bonding network within each ligand remains intact. Thus, we term this direction the "covalent plane". These sheets are held together by much weaker electrostatic interactions between the layers—we term this direction "out-of-plane". Bulk electronic properties depend on the sheet stacking orientations (Figure 1). When these 2D sheets are in their eclipsed stacking conformation, one would expect the overlap between organic $\pi$-orbitals of adjacent layers to be maximized, along with the repulsion of Ni d$_z^2$ orbitals. Deviation from the eclipsed stacking structure reduces the orbital overlap and therefore band dispersion in this direction. This effect is reflected in the k-path from L-to-M and T-to-Y (out-of-plane). However, the impact of stacking conformations on the band dispersion in the covalent plane is not as clear (see the k-path M–Γ–K and Y–Γ–S). Regardless, both staggered and eclipsed conformation are persistently metallic, as evidenced by the band crossing the computed Fermi level and the nonzero density of states (DOS).

The eclipsed structure is, however, energetically disfavored by $\sim$6 kcal/mol (Figure 2a). At the interlayer distance of $\sim$3.36 Å—the experimentally reported interlayer distance for this framework$^{20}$—it is unlikely for Ni$_3$(HIB)$_2$ to obtain the eclipsed structure. As we artificially exfoliate the layers by progressively stepping them apart, both forms converge to the energy of a free monolayer. Interestingly, however, the eclipsed structure exhibits the most disfavored orientation at an interlayer distance of $\sim$5 Å, suggesting that eclipsed layers may be metastable (see also the absence of imaginary frequency in Table S1).

Increasing interlayer spacing reduces the electrostatic interaction between the sheets. Therefore, the metallicity is
diminished in the out-of-plane direction, as shown in Figure 2b (see the flattening of the bands from L-to-M at the interlayer distance of 6.99 and 11.02 Å). The k-path M→Γ→K reveals the impact on the electronic properties of the material in the covalent plane. Although the increase in interlayer distance reduces the number of bands crossing the Fermi level, the metallicity of the material remains unchanged (shown in Figure 2b). Still, we do not know whether the addition of an axial ligand to the Ni²⁺ atoms will be energetically preferable to forming the bulk 2D material.

**Retrofitting Square-Planar Ni²⁺.** We seek to link the coordinatively unsaturated nodes of metallic Ni₃(HIB)₂ monolayers by using extrinsic ligands. Three potential bridging organic linker candidates are explored: 1,4-pyrazine, DABCO (1,4-diazabicyclo[2.2.2]octane), and 4,4'-bipyridine, all of which are commonly used linkers in the MOF field. Retrofitting these linkers results in interlayer spacing of 7 Å (pyrazine), ~9 Å (DABCO), and ~11 Å (bipyridine). In each case, the sheets are sufficiently far apart (per Figure 2b) to minimize π-stacking interactions between the covalent sheets.

The 3D-connected retrofitted structures of Ni₃(HIB)₂ are shown in Figure 3. First, we consider the effect of a pure σ-donor linkage through the inclusion of DABCO (Figure 3a). From an energetic perspective, the DABCO linkers insertion was thermodynamically disfavored by 2.30 kcal/mol (Table 1). From an energetic perspective, the DABCO linkers insertion was thermodynamically disfavored by 2.30 kcal/mol (Table 1). Our phonon calculations revealed imaginary frequencies in the geometrically equilibrated structures, suggesting the material is not dynamically stable. We also noted that the DABCO–Ni bond length converged to 3.06 Å (beyond what any reasonable metal–ligand bond might be), so we employed the density-derived electrostatic and chemical approach (DDEC) to evaluate the bond orders for these bonds. The metal–ligand bond order in the out-of-plane direction is 0.07, which is very weak compared to the in-plane metal–NH bond (bond order of 0.78, bond length of 1.82 Å). For comparison, the bond orders in nonretrofitted Ni₃(HIB)₂ bulk and monolayer Ni–NH bonds are 0.78 and 0.84, respectively. The decreasing bond order in bulk Ni₃(HIB)₂ compared to that of the monolayer is one avenue to assess the importance of the vdW stacking. Considering the long DABCO–Ni bond, the band structure remains very similar to that of the monolayer (Figure 3a), which further indicates that the DABCO linkers are likely not interacting with the Ni₃(HIB)₂ layers. We attribute this to square-planar Ni²⁺ being a weak Lewis acid and axial ligation forming high-spin octahedral Ni²⁺. Because the dₓ orbital is formally occupied in the square-planar complex, σ-donor ligands form a nonbonding interaction.

Both pyrazine and 4,4'-bipyridine are σ-donors but better π-acceptors than DABCO. Retrofitted Ni₃(HIB)₂(1,4-pyrazine)₃ and Ni₃(HIB)₂(4,4'-bipyridine)₁ result in metal–ligand bond lengths of 2.11 and 2.15 Å for the pyrazine and bipyridine analogues, respectively (Figure 3b,c). In the former, a bond order of 0.38 was found for the metal–ligand bond in the out-of-plane direction, which is relatively low compared to the in-plane metal ligation (bond order 0.53). Similarly, for Ni₃(HIB)₂(4,4'-bipyridine)₁ a bond order of 0.36 was found for the metal–ligand bond in the out-of-plane direction (compared to a bond order of 0.52 for the metal–ligand bond in the covalent plane). The inclusion of a π-acceptor dramatically reduces the in-plane bonding interactions. As a result, these inclusions are highly energetically unfavorable: the insertion of bipyridine and pyrazine linkers into the framework increases the Gibbs free energy by 61.85 and 68.61 kcal/mol, respectively (Table 1). Again, the presence of imaginary frequencies revealed that these structures are not dynamically stable (Table S1).

In sum, a retrofitting approach using only σ-donors results in the Ni-MOF preferring nonbonded (or simply intercalated)
pills. The $\pi$-accepting ligands result in a bond, but at extreme energetic penalty due to reorganization of the Ni$^{2+}$ d orbitals, inhibiting the binding of fifth and sixth axial ligands. Hence, retrofitting Ni$_3$(HIB)$_2$ with the pillars creates unstable materials, independent of their properties.

**Transmetalation.** Given the energetic penalty of creating octahedral Ni$^{2+}$, we now examine the possibility of altering metal composition to minimize the d$^z_2$ repulsive interaction. To do so, we expand our study to include other divalent transition metals in the form of Cu$_3$(HIB)$_2$, Fe$_3$(HIB)$_2$, and Cr$_3$(HIB)$_2$. The Cu$^{2+}$ material has been previously synthesized, but it is also a late transition metal with associated with the metal repulsing the Mσ−π bonding interaction with axial linkers. Further-}

---

**Figure 4.** Band structures of eclipsed M$_3$(HIB)$_2$ showing all materials are metallic and the band remain dispersive near the Fermi level for all metal identity.

materials show similar band dispersion behavior to that of the nickel analogue; bands cross the computed Fermi level in both the out-of-plane and the covalent plane directions. As expected, the increased interlayer distance also flattened the band dispersion in the out-of-plane direction (see Figure 5).

**Retrofitting Cr- and Fe-HIB Derivatives.** The retrofitted MOFs yield metal–axial ligand bond lengths of 1.95 Å (pyrazine), 1.98 Å (bipyridine), 2.16 Å (DABCO) for Fe$^{2+}$ analogues, and 2.04 Å (pyrazine), 2.06 Å (bipyridine), and 2.24 Å (DABCO) for the Cr$^{2+}$ analogues. The formation of a bonding interaction between DABCO with Cr$^{2+}$ and Fe$^{2+}$ metal centers clearly shows that earlier transition metals can form pure σ-bonding interaction with axial linkers. Furthermore, there is a slight elongation of the in-plane Fe$^{2+}$ bonds after retrofitting (compared to the nonretrofitted structure, see Table S2) which can be rationalized by increased e$^−$ density associated with the metal repulsing the M–pillar bond.

---

**Figure 5.** (a) Effect of pyrazine insertion on the band structure of Cr$_3$(HIB)$_2$ and Fe$_3$(HIB)$_2$. (b) Charge density of a dispersive band that gave rise to out-of-plane metallicity in 2D eclipsed bulk Cr$_3$(HIB)$_2$ due to orbital overlap. (c) Charge density of dispersive band that gave rise to out-of-plane metallicity in Cr$_3$(HIB)$_2$(1,4 pyrazine) due to covalent interaction in the axial direction.

The bond orders for the metal–axial ligands were computed to be 0.32 (DABCO), 0.53 (pyrazine), and 0.51 (bipyridine) for the Fe$^{2+}$ analogues and 0.27 (DABCO), 0.45 (pyrazine), and 0.42 (bipyridine) for the Cr$^{2+}$ analogues. These bond orders are somewhat smaller than those computed for the metal–ligand bonds in the covalent direction (approximately 0.1–0.2 lower for pyrazine and bipyridine linkers and 0.3–0.4 lower for DABCO linker, Table S2). These weaker (longer) bonds result from the nonuniform distribution of electron density between metal orbitals and the in-plane and out-of-plane ligands due to their different shape and orientation. These factors contribute to the Jahn–Teller distortion observed in the coordination sphere of our retrofitted structures, which commonly occurs for octahedral complexes. The metal–axial ligand bond orders for Fe$_3$(HIB)$_2$(DABCO)$_3$ and Cr$_3$(HIB)$_2$(DABCO)$_3$ are small but still support the existence of a σ-bond interaction between the DABCO linker and the Fe$^{2+}$ and Cr$^{2+}$ metal centers. The formation of these axial metal–ligand bonds is supported by the observed Jahn–Teller distortions and the decrease in bond order of the metal–ligand bonds in the covalent direction. This decrease in bond order is not observed for the Ni$_3$(HIB)$_2$(DABCO)$_3$ structure, where the metal–axial ligand bond order is significantly smaller (0.07).

The electronic band structures of the 3D retrofitted MOFs (for Cr and Fe) show the retention of band dispersion in the covalent direction after bridging linker insertion (M=Γ−K, Figure 5). Interestingly, for these earlier transition metals, retrofitting also allows the materials to regain dispersion in the out-of-plane direction without the π–σ orbital interactions that exist between the layers when they were closer to each other: an example is shown in Figure 5a, T−Y, along with the charge density comparison before and after retrofitting in Figure 5b,c. Electronic band structures for other retrofitted MOFs depicting similar results can be found in Figure S2. This out-of-plane covalency is due to the metal–axial ligand bonding interaction (formed from σ-type interactions hindered by d$^z_2$ occupancy in Ni$^{2+}$ analogues). Our calculations suggest that the σ-bond interaction allows delocalization of charge in the out-of-plane direction via the through-bond charge transport...
pathway. In Cr\(_3\)(HIB)\(_2\)(1,4-pyrazine)\(_3\), the partial charge density from the dispersive, metallic band in the out-of-plane direction (shown in Figure 3c) reveals the Cr–pyrazine bonding interaction. A similar interaction was present in the Fe\(^{2+}\) analogue but was not observed in the Ni\(^{2+}\) analogue, which possesses flatter bands in the out-of-plane direction (see Figure 3c).

In sum, all metal–axial ligand bond orders for the Fe- and Cr-based retrofitted MOFs are large compared to the Ni-based retrofitted MOFs. Early transition metals are better retrofitting candidates because they allow both \(\sigma\)-donation and \(\pi\)-backboning interactions from the axial linkers. Furthermore, the formation energies of these 3D retrofitted MOFs from their 2D parent frameworks are largely negative (Table 1), indicating that for Cr\(^{2+}\) and Fe\(^{2+}\) forming octahedral coordination spheres from their initial square-planar coordination spheres is energetically favorable. Unfortunately, phonon calculations for some of the retrofitted 3D MOFs reveal imaginary frequencies (see Table S1). These negative modes would suggest that corresponding structures may not be thermodynamically metastable. However, these frequencies may instead correspond to artificial ring rotations between the retrofitted linkages, particularly given the formation energies are so favorable.

### CONCLUSIONS

Together, our study demonstrates that 3D conductive MOFs can be generated by retrofitting covalent 2D sheets that house square planar metals with partially, or unoccupied, \(d^2\) orbitals using neutral N-donor pillaring ligands. The Ni\(_3\)(HIB)\(_2\) framework exhibits more dispersive bands, especially in the out-of-plane direction, when adopting the eclipsed stacking conformation. However, the eclipsed structure is energetically unfavorable compared to the staggered configuration. Because of \(d^2\) orbital occupancy, retrofitting the Ni\(_3\)(HIB)\(_2\) scaffold with bipyridine, pyrazine, and DABCO generates thermodynamically destabilized structures. However, incorporating transition metals with reduced \(d^2\) density form bonding interactions with both DABCO and the aromatic linkages. The resulting materials are thermodynamically stable and potentially dynamically metastable. Although direct synthesis of the Cr and Fe analogues (Fe\(_3\)(HIB)\(_2\) and Cr\(_3\)(HIB)\(_2\)) may not be tractable, ligand pillaring approaches and metal exchange may afford synthetic access to these structures and the emergence of a novel class of 3D-connected electrical conductors.

### COMPUTATIONAL METHODS

Structural equilibration of both the eclipsed and staggered Ni\(_3\)(HIB)\(_2\) was performed with DFT as implemented in the Vienna \(ab\) \(initio\) Simulation Package (VASP, ver. 5.4.4). Other metal derivatives were created by substituting Ni and converged by using the same parameters.

All optimized structures were used for electronic band structures and corresponding density-of-states calculations at the GGA-PBEsol level of theory since all materials are metallic, and qualitative analysis of band curvature is not thought to change dramatically by using a hybrid functional in this case.\(^{18}\) Additionally, PBEsol significantly reduced the computational expense. GGA+U calculations and HSE06 functionals were also explored on the bulk staggered structure of Ni\(_3\)(HIB)\(_2\) to clarify that GGA-PBEsol functional is sufficient for this study. Two U parameters were selected (3 and 6.2 eV) as recommended by the literature on related materials.\(^{34,35,56}\)

Phonon modes and frequencies were obtained via the finite differences method as implemented in VASP at the zone-center (Γ-point). Central difference was enforced, and the step size was set to be 0.015 Å as default. The unrestricted GGA-PBEsol exchange-correlation functional was used with the same convergence criteria as above.

### ASSOCIATED CONTENT

Supporting Information
The Supporting Information is available free of charge at https://pubs.acs.org/doi/10.1021/acsaelm.0c01135.

- Extended computational details (PDF)
- Equilibrium geometry files for all models (ZIP)

### AUTHOR INFORMATION

#### Corresponding Author

Christopher H. Hendon — Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry, University of Oregon, Eugene, Oregon 97403, United States; orcid.org/0000-0002-7132-768X; Email: chendon@uoregon.edu

#### Authors

Khoa N. Le — Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry, University of Oregon, Eugene, Oregon 97403, United States

Jenna L. Mancuso — Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry, University of Oregon, Eugene, Oregon 97403, United States

Complete contact information is available at: https://pubs.acs.org/10.1021/acsaelm.0c01135

#### Author Contributions

K.N.L. and C.H.H. performed the experiments. All authors contributed to writing the manuscript.

#### Notes

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Computational studies were performed by using the High-Performance Computing cluster at the University of Oregon (Talapas), the Extreme Science and Engineering Discovery Environment (XSEDE), which is supported by National Science Foundation Grant ACI-1548562, and the Portland State University machine, Coeus, which is supported by the NSF (DM1624776). C.H.H. is supported in part by the National Science Foundation under Grant DMR-1956403. K.N.L. is supported by the National Science Foundation Graduate Research Fellowship under Grant 1650114.

### REFERENCES


