

**Professor Naomi Zack, UO Philosophy Dept, Fall 2012**

**Phil & Race: Cont Iss: Schedule details 16757 PHIL 657**

<b>Days</b>	<b>Time</b>	<b>Location</b>	<b>Date Range</b>
TR	2:00pm - 3:50pm	Prince Lucien Campbell 314	Sep 24, 2012 - Dec 02, 2012

## SYLLABUS

### *IDEAS OF or ABOUT RACE*

#### **Subject Matter**

Racial categories shape human lives, not as mere variety but in terms of basic goods and rights in human existence. So the taxonomy of ‘race’ is deeply connected to what many understand to be ‘racism,’ or unequal discriminatory treatment of nonwhites, and hearts and minds prejudice against them. Since the 1970s, a vast amount of multidisciplinary literature in the social sciences, humanities, and of course, philosophy, has developed concerning the subjects of race and racism. Current controversies include: the biological reality of racial taxonomy, what counts as racism, and what counts as white privilege or the idea that white identities give those who have them special unearned advantages in society (of which they may or may not be aware). There are in addition, intersections of gender studies with race studies and issues of social class, primarily that of poverty and educational opportunity. Also, not to be neglected is recent phenomenological work on race—how having disadvantaged racial identities are experienced by those who have them.

The angle into that material in this course will be *ideas of or about race*. People have different ideas about what race and racism are, over history, at the same time (depending on their own race class, and gender), according to disciplinary and professional orientations, and based on various configurations of power. If human racial categories are not determined by nature or at this time supported by findings in the human biological sciences---which they are not---this says little about the importance of race socially, psychologically, or phenomenologically. Indeed, if human races are not ‘natural kinds,’ but something that human beings have made up, continue to make up, and live out based on what they make up, then race is very closely related to ideas about race.

#### **Course Structure and Aim**

The course will proceed as a directed seminar. Students will choose the material from the readings that they present in advance and sometimes, not everyone will read the same material, although everyone should benefit from the presentations and discussions. There will be one outside speaker in a video conference. Grades will be 50-50 between seminar presentation and a final paper that will suitable for conference presentation after it is planned, submitted in draft, and revised.

#### GRADE COMPONENTS

Participation and seminar attendance - 50%

Final Paper – 50%

**Seminar Presentations of Readings** It will **not** be acceptable for you to take notes on your readings and read those notes, because that does not result in engaged and engaging seminar presentations. How to Present? Read and take notes, and then: Read your notes and condense them to one page, double spaced or no more than 300 words of Exegesis, Interpretation, and Criticism---and talk to the rest of us from that one page.

**The Paper** needs to be your best polished written work, with careful scholarly references---endnotes and references. In choosing a topic, you can begin with the list of resources at the end of the syllabus, or develop something on your own. 10-15 pages and no more than 4000 words, with word count on top. The paper should have an introduction, which is also an abstract, and be well organized into sections that carry out what you say you will do in the introduction. (Write the introduction after you write the paper.)

### Schedule of Readings

*Because of the seminar format, all readings must be done before we meet—Everyone will be Expected to Participate in Every Meeting.*

All readings are to be done before the date for which they are assigned. All readings are on BlackBoard. All papers are due on the dates indicated at the beginning of the class.

**On BB:** W.E.B. DuBois, “The Conservation of Races;” Ian Hacking, “Making Up People,” 2 versions; U.S. court cases concerning race; M. Grant, *The Passing of the Great Race* (text on BB and at [http://www.jrbooksonline.com/PDF\\_Books/PassingOfGreatRace.pdf](http://www.jrbooksonline.com/PDF_Books/PassingOfGreatRace.pdf)); S.J. Gould on Morton’s skull measurements, <http://www.colorado.edu/MCDB/MCDB4234/readings/Morton-Skulls-Gould.pdf> and on BB; bell hooks “On Post-Modern Blackness.”

#### **On Reserve, Knight Library:**

C. Eze, ed. *Race and the Enlightenment*

C. Mills, *The Racial Contract*.

J. Flax, *The American Dream in Black and White: The Clarence Thomas Hearings*, 1998.

G. Yancy, *Black Bodies, White Gazes* (2008) and G. Yancy, *Look, a White!*

N. Zack, *Thinking about Race* (2006); \_\_\_\_\_ *Philosophy of Science and Race*.

#### WEEKS

I - Sept 25 and 27 -Introduction

Tues. Ideas about race, structure of course, articles at end of syllabus.

Thurs. Very fast Introduction through *Thinking About Race*. Students present, first half.

II – Oct. 2 and 4

G. Yancy, *Black Bodies, White Gazes* (2008) and G. Yancy, *Look, a White!* (2012)

III – Oct. 9 Video conference with Yancy.

Oct. 11. Very fast Introduction through *Thinking About Race*. Students present, second half.

IV – Oct. 16 and 18. Ian Hacking, “Making Up People;” Eze, *Race and the Enlightenment* – All read everything. Individual Presentations of Chapters.

V- Oct. 23 **Your paper plan, no longer than 1 page is due. Please email it to [nzack@uoregon.edu](mailto:nzack@uoregon.edu), so that I can send it back to you with 'track change' suggestions.** Eze, *Race and the Enlightenment* Oct. 25. M. Grant, *The Passing of the Great Race*

VI Oct. 30 and Nov. 1. Mills, *The Racial Contract*

VII

Nov. 6. W.E.B. Du Bois, "On the Conservation of Races; S. J. Gould on Morton.

Nov. 8, Zack, *Philosophy of Science and Race*, chaps. 5, 6, and 7. pp. 73-118. NZ will present, but please all read to critique.

VIII – Nov 12. **First Draft of Paper due. Please email it to me so that I can suggest revisions with track changes.**

Nov. 13 and 15. Important U.S. Court cases – All read everything. NZ will present

IX – Nov. 20 and 22. J. Flax, *American Dream in Black and White*; bell hooks "On Post-Modern Blackness." All read everything. Students present.

X. Nov. 27. Open discussion of final papers. Please be prepared to state your main ideas in no more than 5 minutes.

Final Paper. Dec. 4. Tues. 2PM. Philosophy Office, 338 PLC

General Bibliography for Race (very abbreviated – please see me for additional sources)

African American Philosophy – classic

Crummell, Alexander. *Destiny and Race: Selected Writings, 1840-1898*. Wilson Jeremiah Moses, ed. University of Mass Press, 1992.

Douglass, Frederick. *A Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass, an America Slave*. Penguin Classics, 1982.

DuBois, W.E.B. *The Souls of Black Folk*. Signet Classic, 1995.

King, Jr., Martin Luther. *A Testament of Hope: The Essential Writings and Speeches of Martin Luther King, Jr.* Macmillan, 2002.

Locke, Alain. *The New Negro*. Johnson Reprint Corp., 1998.

Washington, Booker T. *Up From Slavery: An Autobiography*. Reed Books, 2006.

African American Philosophy - contemporary

Allen, Anita. *Uneasy Access: Privacy for Women in a Free Society*. Rowman and Littlefield, 1988.

Appiah, Kwame Anthony and Amy Gutmann. *Color Conscious: The Political Morality of Race*. Princeton University Press, 1996.

- Boxill, Bernard. *Blacks and Social Justice*. Rowman and Littlefield, 1992.
- Davis, Angela. *Women, Race, and Class*. Random House, 1983.
- Gordon, Lewis R. *Bad Faith and Antiracist Racism*. Atlantic Highlands: Humanities Press, 1995.
- Grant, Jacquelyn Jacquelyn. *White Women's Christ and Black Women's Jesus*. Scholars Press, 1989.
- Harris, Leonard, ed. *Philosophy Born of Struggle: Anthology of Afro-American Philosophy from 1917*. Kendall Hunt Publishing Co., 1983.
- Lawson, Bill E., ed. *The Underclass Question*. Temple University Press, 1992.
- Lott, Tommy L. ed. *Subjugation and Bondage*. Rowman and Littlefield, 1998.
- McGary, Howard. *Race and Social Justice*. Blackwell, 1998.
- Mills, Charles W. *The Racial Contract*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1997.
- Moody-Adams, Michele M. *Morality, Culture and Philosophy: Fieldwork in Familiar Places*. Harvard University Press, 1997.
- Moses, Greg. *Revolution of Conscience: Martin Luther King, Jr., and the Philosophy of Nonviolence*. Guilford Publications, 1998.
- Mosley, Albert. *Affirmative Action: Social Justice or Unfair Preference?* Rowman and Littlefield, 1996.
- Outlaw, Lucius. *On Race and Philosophy*. Routledge, 1996.
- Roberts, Rodney C., ed. *Injustice and Rectification*. Peter Lang Publishers, 2002.
- Thomas, Laurence. *Vessels of Evil: American Slavery and the Holocaust*. Temple University Press, 1993.
- West, Cornel. *Prophesy Deliverance! An Afro-American Revolutionary Christianity*. Westminister: John Knox Press, 1982.
- Yancy, George, ed. *African-American Philosophers, 17 Conversations*. Routledge, 1998.
- Zack, Naomi. *Thinking About Race*. Thomson Wadsworth, 2006.
- \_\_\_\_\_ *The Ethics and Mores of Race: Equality after the History of Philosophy* (2011)

Allen, Paula Gunn. *The Sacred Hoop*. Beacon Press, 1992.

Cordova, V.F. *How It Is: The Native American Philosophy of V. F. Cordova*. Linda

Hogan, Kathleen Dean Moore, Kurt Peters, and Ted Jojoba, eds. University of Arizona Press, 2007.

Cotton, Angela L. and Christa Acampora Crista Davis eds. *Cultural Sites of Critical Insight: Philosophy, Aesthetics, and African American and Native American Women's Writings*. SUNY Press, 2007.

Waters, Anne. *American Indian Thought: Philosophical Essays*. Blackwell Publishing, 2003.

Weaver, Jace. *Defending Mother Earth: Native American Perspectives on Environmental Justice*. Orbis Books, 1996.

#### Contemporary Latin American Philosophy

Alcoff, Linda and Eduardo Mendieta. *Thinking from the Underside of History: Enrique Dussel's Philosophy of Liberation*. Roman and Littlefield, 2000.

Gracia, Jorge J. E. and Elizabeth Millan-Zaibert, eds. *Latin American Philosophy for the 21st Century: The Human Condition, Values, and the Search for Identity*. Prometheus Books, 2003.

Mendieta, Eduardo. *Global Fragments: Critical Theory, Latin America and Globalizations*. SUNY Press, 2007.

Nuccetelli, Susana. *Latin American Thought: Philosophical Problems and Arguments*. Westview Press, 2002.

Schutte, Ofelia. *Cultural Identity and Social Liberation in Latin American Thought*. SUNY Press, 1993.

#### Also

#### Afro-centric Thought

Bernal, Martin. *Black Athena: The Afroasiatic Roots of Classical Civilization*. Rutgers University Press, 3 vols, 1987-2006.

Asante, Molefi. *The Afrocentric Idea*. Temple University Press, 1998.

Gordon, Lewis R. *Her Majesty's Other Children: Sketches of Racism from a Neocolonial Age*. Rowman and Littlefield, 1997.

#### African Philosophy

Appiah, K. Anthony. *In My Father's House: Africa in the Philosophy of Culture*. Oxford University Press, 1992.

Gyeke, Kwame. *Tradition and Modernity*. Oxford University Press, 1997.

Eze, Emmanuel, ed. *Postcolonial African Philosophy*. Blackwell, 1997.

Hountondji, Paulin J. *African Philosophy: Myth and Reality*. Indiana University Press, 1996.

Mbiti, John. *African Religions and Philosophy*. Doubleday, 1970.

## SEPT. 25 – IDEAS ABOUT RACE

Obama Has Ties to Slavery Not by His Father but His Mother, Research Suggests



Rajah Bose for The New York Times

Mark Bunch, who directs his family's online lineage project, said of President Obama, "I'm his fifth cousin twice removed."

By SHERYL GAY STOLBERG Published: July 30, 2012 A version of this article appeared in print on July 30, 2012, on page A9 of the New York edition with the headline: Obama Has Ties to Slavery Not by His Father but His Mother, Research Suggests.

WASHINGTON — President Obama's biography — son of a black father from Kenya and a white mother from Kansas — has long suggested that unlike most African-Americans, his roots did not include slavery.

- Graphic: The President's Family Tree



Rajah Bose for The New York Times

One tool used by a team of genealogists over the course of two years was an online database maintained by the Bunch family.

Now a team of genealogists is upending that thinking, saying that Mr. Obama's mother had, in addition to her European ancestors, at least one African forebear and that the president is most likely descended from one of the first documented African slaves in the United States.

The findings are scheduled to be announced on Monday by Ancestry.com, a genealogy company based in Provo, Utah. Its team, while lacking definitive proof, said it had evidence that "strongly suggests" Mr. Obama's family tree — on his mother's side — stretches back nearly four centuries to a slave in colonial Virginia named John Punch.

In 1640, Mr. Punch, then an indentured servant, escaped from Virginia and went to Maryland. He was captured there and, along with two white servants who had also escaped, was put on trial. His punishment — servitude for life — was harsher than what the white servants received, and it has led some historians to regard him as the first African to be legally sanctioned as a slave, years before Virginia adopted laws allowing slavery.

Historians say there was a trade in human labor, of both whites and blacks, during this period in American history. There were also some free African-Americans. Beginning around 1617, indentured servants were bought and sold, as were debtors, in the Chesapeake Bay region, said Ira Berlin, a University of Maryland professor and expert in the history of slavery. But while those people were in an "unfree condition," he said, historians cannot pinpoint a date for the beginning of the slave trade.

"What makes the John Punch case interesting is here is a guy who is definitely a slave," said Professor Berlin, who did not participate in the examination of the president's ancestors. The Ancestry.com team used DNA analysis to make the connection, and it also combed through marriage and property records to trace Mr. Obama's maternal ancestry to the time and place where Mr. Punch lived. The company said records suggested that Mr. Punch fathered children with a white woman, who passed her free status on to those children, giving rise to a family of a slightly different name, the Bunches, that ultimately spawned Mr. Obama's mother, Stanley Ann Dunham.

The findings come as more and more Americans are discovering their own mixed-race heritage. Elizabeth Shown Mills, a former president of the American Society of Genealogists, said the Internet, coupled with the ease of DNA testing and heightened interest among both amateur and professional genealogists, was helping to reveal the extent of racial intermingling over the centuries.

"It is becoming increasingly common now because people are discovering it," Ms. Mills said. "In the past, very few records were available. Very few people made the effort to do the research."

The Ancestry.com team spent two years examining Mr. Obama's mother's past, focusing on the mixed-race Bunch line. The researchers said that over time, as the Bunches continued to intermarry, they became prominent landowners in colonial Virginia and were known as white. "We sort of stumbled across it," said Anastasia Harman, the lead researcher. "We were just doing general research into the president's family tree, and as we started digging back in time, we realized that the Bunch family were African-American."

There is no evidence that Ms. Dunham had any inkling that she might have had African-American ancestry, said Janny Scott, her biographer. By the mid-1800s, according to a 2007 article in The Chicago Sun-Times, one of Ms. Dunham's Bunch ancestors had a son who fought for the Confederacy in the Civil War.



The Ancestry.com group traced two major Bunch family branches, one that lived as white and stayed in Virginia for generations and another that left for the Carolinas. In North Carolina, the Bunches were recorded as “mulatto” in early records, and their descendants are also the president’s cousins.

Mr. Obama descends from the Virginia branch, which eventually migrated to Tennessee, where his great-great-great-great-grandmother Anna Bunch was born. Her daughter Frances Allred, who was born in 1834, moved to Kansas. Four generations later, in 1942, with the family still in Kansas, Mr. Obama’s mother was born.

But the research left open a question: Was John Punch, the slave, a Bunch ancestor? Because records have been destroyed, there is no definitive proof.

Still, some factors led Ms. Harman and her group to a conclusion. The surnames were similar. There was DNA evidence showing that the Bunches had sub-Saharan African heritage. And a very small number of Africans were living in Virginia in the mid-1600s. All that convinced the team that the nation’s first black president was descended from Mr. Punch.

“The odds, based on what does actually survive, strongly suggest that President Barack Obama is a descendant (he would be the 11th great-grandson) of the first enslaved African in America,” Ms. Harman and her team wrote in a research paper that Ancestry.com intended to release on its Web site on Monday.

The team shared its findings with The New York Times, which consulted two independent genealogists — Ms. Mills, who specializes in Southern genealogy, and Johni Cerny, who specializes in black ancestry — about the findings. Both said there was no way to be certain of the Punch-Bunch connection. But both also said the Ancestry.com team made a solid case. “The research, I am convinced, is sound,” said Ms. Mills, who also reviewed the findings at Ancestry.com’s request. “The P and the B are virtually meaningless in historical context. What matters is the historical evidence that can be mustered to place the same people in the same area.”

Ms. Cerny was more skeptical but said the research team’s careful wording was appropriate. “I’m sure people will be tantalized and try to prove or disprove it,” she said. “But what they’re saying is very safe and appropriate. I would be tempted myself to try to make that connection.”

One reason the Ancestry.com team could make the connection was the Bunch family itself. The extended family maintains an online database that traces the family tree. It is supplemented by DNA testing showing that the men in the family have genetic markers consistent with sub-Saharan African descent. The Ancestry.com paper said the Bunches’ particular DNA profile was common in Cameroon.

“I consider myself Caucasian, but I find that my mixed-race roots go way back,” said Mark Bunch, who administers the Bunch family project. Mr. Bunch, 53, the finance director for a community hospital in the agricultural town of Othello, in eastern Washington State, learned of the project several years ago from a cousin. He bought a home DNA test kit, swabbed the inside of his cheek three times and sent it off for analysis. What came back — a genetic blueprint that included sub-Saharan African roots — surprised Mr. Bunch. Then came another surprise: President Obama was a distant cousin. “I’m his fifth cousin twice removed,” Mr. Bunch said. “Of more surprise was the African Y chromosome. The relationship to President Obama was kind of the icing on the cake after that.”

**Questions raised.**

1. What notion of race is the NYTimes and the genealogical scientists assuming.
2. Is there a “one-drop” rule for slavery?



3. If African-American identity rests on slave ancestry, does the person who is African American have to know that he or she has slave ancestry?
4. What is the political value of this research in an election year? What assumptions does that value(s) rest on?
5. Does research like this reinforce or destabilize received ideas about race? Why?

### “How Well You Sleep May Hinge on Race”



Benjamin Norman for The New York Times

BROOKLYN Moleendo Stewart sees inequality as playing a role in his sleep problems.

By DOUGLAS QUENQUA

Published: August 20, 2012

Moleendo Stewart can't say for sure what's caused his lifelong sleeping problems. But he has his suspicions.



#### [The Well Sleep Quiz](#)

How does sleep affect health, relationships and well-being? Take this sleep quiz to learn more about the fascinating and sometimes strange world of sleep.

There's the childhood spent in loud, restless neighborhoods in Miami. "You hear people shooting guns all night, dealing drugs," said Mr. Stewart, 41, who lives in the East Flatbush section of Brooklyn. He also cites his weight, 260 pounds, down from a peak of 310.

Sleep experts would point to another factor working against Mr. Stewart: He is a black man. The idea that race or ethnicity might help determine how well people sleep is relatively

new among sleep researchers. But in the few short years that epidemiologists, demographers and [psychologists](#) have been studying the link, they have repeatedly come to the same conclusion: In the United States, at least, sleep is not colorblind. Non-Hispanic whites get more and better-quality sleep than people of other races, studies repeatedly show. Blacks are the most likely to get shorter, more restless sleep.

What researchers don't yet know is why.

"We're not at a point where we can say for certain is it nature versus nurture, is it race or is it socioeconomics," said Dr. Michael A. Grandner, a research associate with the Center for Sleep and Neurobiology at the University of Pennsylvania. But when it comes to sleep, "there is a unique factor of race we're still trying to understand."

Whatever the cause, doctors say that unlocking the secret to racial sleep disparities could yield insights into why people in some minority groups experience higher rates of [high blood pressure](#), [obesity](#) and [diabetes](#). Helping poor or immigrant populations to get more solid sleep, they say, could also help break the cycle of poverty and disadvantage.

"When people aren't sleeping as well during the night, they aren't as productive during the day, and they're not as healthy," said Dr. Mercedes R. Carnethon, associate professor of [preventive medicine](#) at Northwestern University Feinberg School of Medicine. "It's a self-perpetuating cycle."

The latest evidence that race and ethnicity can affect sleep came in June at the annual meeting of the Associated Professional Sleep Societies, held in Boston. In one of two studies on the topic presented there, white participants from the Chicago area were found to get an average of 7.4 hours of sleep per night; Hispanics and Asians averaged 6.9 hours and blacks 6.8 hours. Sleep quality — defined as ease in falling asleep and length of uninterrupted sleep — was also higher for whites than for blacks.

While those findings are consistent with earlier studies, this one, led by Dr. Carnethon, adjusted for risk factors like cardiovascular disease, [sleep apnea](#) and obesity. Even so, blacks and members of other minorities, who are statistically more prone to experience such problems, still got less and more disruptive sleep than whites.

One obvious remaining culprit, says Dr. Carnethon, is socioeconomics.

Because Chicago is still a fairly segregated city, "the blacks and Hispanics in our study were generally living in neighborhoods that are closer to freeways, so you have freeway noise, there's more business noise at night, and there's potentially more crime, which is stressful to people," Dr. Carnethon said. People in lower-income neighborhoods are also more likely to have multiple jobs or to work odd hours, which can interfere with sleep.

The idea that differences in work and living conditions can explain the racial sleep disparities is a popular one among sleep experts. But studies that have accounted for those factors suggest a more complex reality.

One such study from 2005 — also taking place in Chicago — measured sleep among 669 participants while adjusting for education, income and employment status. In the end, black men on average still slept 82 minutes less per night than white women, who were found to sleep the best of anyone in the study.

Of course, isolating the real-life effects of social inequality can be tricky. "There are more subtle differences" among people than income and education, said Dr. Kristen Knutson, assistant professor of medicine at the University of Chicago and an author of the study. "We had no way to control for stress, and there are social stresses an African-American man might feel that a white man with the same income and education level wouldn't."

Mr. Stewart, the Brooklyn resident, said he did see discrimination as playing a role in his sleep problems.

“As a black person in America, even if you succeed in terms of education, you still have to deal with the inherent inequality of society,” said Mr. Stewart, an administrator for a program that exposes students in racial minorities to careers in science and math. “I don’t blame it on the majority — that’s just simplistic. But in general it’s not a fair thing, and you stress because of that.”

Sleep experts refer to this as the “autonomy” problem, and studies have shown it has an effect on sleep. “People who feel they have control over their lives were able to feel secure at night, go to sleep, sleep well, and wake up well in the morning and do it all over again,” said Dr. Lauren Hale, associate professor of preventive medicine at Stony Brook University on Long Island, referring to a study she conducted in 2009. “That’s part of the cycle not just for blacks and minorities, but other disadvantaged populations.”

At least one study suggests that socioeconomic factors affecting sleep are highly specific to race and gender. For example, being divorced or widowed was particularly detrimental to the sleep of Hispanic men, while never being married was more likely to take a toll on the sleep of Asian men. Asian women lacking in education were more likely to report sleep problems than similarly educated white women. And men of all races who were in relationships slept better than single men, regardless of relationship quality; for women, the quality of the relationship was more likely to affect sleep.

“There’s an effect of socioeconomics,” said Dr. Grandner, a lead author of the study, “but it’s not really the economic. It’s more about the socio.”

It may also be the culture. Black and Hispanic children in America are far less likely to have regularly enforced bedtimes than white children, according to a 2010 study conducted by Dr. Hale for the National Institutes of Health. White children were also more likely to have “language-based” bedtime routines — those that involve reading or storytelling — both of which are associated with a wide range of cognitive and behavioral advantages.

These routines establish patterns that can last a lifetime, Dr. Hale said. “If routines are absent, especially these language-based routines, then children may be missing out on opportunities to develop and sleep optimally,” she said.

And some researchers aren’t ready to discount biology. In a forthcoming study, Dr. Grandner found that short sleepers are more likely to have elevated levels of C-reactive protein, but how much depended on race. C-reactive protein is produced by the body when inflammation is present and has previously been implicated in sleep problems.

The consequences of chronic sleep deprivation for all races include a higher risk of obesity, heart disease, kidney disease, stroke and high blood pressure. Other insidious threats — like depression, mood swings and decreased learning capacity — have all been linked to lack of sleep, both as consequences and causes. In order to break the cycle, researchers say, patients need to make sleep a priority.

“There’s this idea in this country that sleep might not be the most important thing, that we have to get things done and sleep can be de-prioritized,” said Dr. Grandner, comparing America with European countries that carve out midday periods for sleep. “We need to be thinking about sleep the same way we think about [diet](#) and exercise.”

**Question:**

What does the researcher mean that it is unknown how much is due to race and how much to socioeconomics? What do you think is meant by ‘race’ in this context?

